MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard **January 27, 2011**

Present: Richard Dana, Robert Ferguson, Jennifer Haskamp, Matt Hill, Rich Laffin, John Manning, Lee Meyer, David Riehle, Mark Thomas, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel

Absent: Renee Hutter (excused), Matt Mazanec (excused)

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Boulware

BUSINESS MEETING

CALL TO ORDER: 5:10 PM by John Manning (Chair)

I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA: The agenda was approved as presented. (Riehle, Thomas)

II. CONFLICT OF INTEREST: None were stated

III. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS: There were no announcements.

IV. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS:

- **A.** Victoria Theater Designation update Staff is working to get this on the City Council agenda in February and will inform the HPC of the public hearing date.
- **B.** Jacob Schmidt Brewery Historic District Designation update The HPC received a \$7000 Legacy Grant. Paul Larson was hired to complete the designation study. Contracts have been drafted. The project timeline does not allow much room to adjust any dates. The designation should occur in May. Staff is working to draft the design guidelines and an intern is researching other brewery historic districts to assemble an outline. The Fort Road Federation will hot a meeting on February 14 at 7 pm during their regular meeting. Neighbors and owners will be invited. A flyer will go out next week.

V. PUBLIC HEARING/PERMIT REVIEW

A. 214 Fourth Street East, Lowertown Historic District, by Michael Bjornberg, HGA, Inc., applicant, for permits to alter and reconstruct portions of the train deck, site improvements and rehabilitation of the Union Depot head house and concourse. **File #11-011** (Spong, 266-6714).

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Staff noted that the findings were general and addressed proposed work that does not comply with the guidelines or required further consultation. Staff brought forward the letter from SHPO staff and asked that the HPC support the SHPO recommendations. Staff stated that the HPC conditions from the July 22, 2010 hearing were added to these conditions, as not all were completed. The HPC will conduct both regulatory review and review as a 106 consulting part. Staff recommended that the HPC resolve to support the December 20, 2010 plans with conditions. Staff will draft a final resolution to bring to the HPC to memorialize.

The applicant was present to give a presentation and discuss the proposal. Steve Morris, RCRRA, thanked staff and the HPC for their work with the project. Also present were: Kevin Dalager, Michael Bjornberg (HGA), Greg Brown (URS), and Jean Garbarini (Close Landscape Arch). Bjornberg talked about the project schedule. Dalager explained the timeline in more detail noting that project completion is scheduled for 2013. Bjornberg discussed the major building components and historical precedent. He addressed SHPO concerns stating that

the new platforms are sized to meet code, the railings at the carriageway are not historic and willingness to minimize the bird-deterrent system. Brown outlined the track/deck layout for the new commissioners. Bjornberg showed the current conditions and initial, alternate and future build-outs. He described the exterior materials such as the roof tile, the opening of the skylights, the new Kellogg entrance and the remnant and the proposed materials for elevator 6. Manning asked with the brick will match. Bjornberg replied that it would. Brown pointed out that the wall along Kellogg will have 21" of deck exposed, unlike the image shown in the presentation. Bjornberg showed historic photos that revealed the railing at the front plaza was not historic. The effect of the lighting in the soffit behind the columns was demonstrated in the presentation. Bjornberg also discussed the historic lighting, introduction of new lighting and the restoration of existing. The replication of existing stone treatments of the carriage way was discussed. Staff asked if the height of the stone wall would lessen the height of the required rail in order to lessen the impact. The new head house entry plans were shown having symmetrical stairs and an elevator in the middle. The railings will be similar to the historic, but not so much as to cause confusion. Areas of the carriageway walls that are not as "finished" are proposed to be stuccoed. Waiting room windows options were discussed:

- New steel replacement windows: loss of historic fabric & energy efficiency gain
- New storm windows (interior or exterior): damage terra cotta sills, abatement & energy efficiency gain
- Repair existing: maintain historic fabric & abatement

Laffin asked about security. Morris replied Amtrak and Metro Transit will have security policies in place. Bjornberg replied it will be addressed on the design side to accommodate future needs.

Trout-Oertel stated that the windows are the most difficult issue that was brought up and asked if the waiting room will be air conditioned. She stated that operable windows will be issued. Bjornberg stated they could be a maintenance issue. Staff replied there are storm windows with operable panels. Trout-Oertel stated the difference in the reveal is significant.

Laffin asked how the sprinkler system will be concealed. Bjornberg replied it will be run through interstitial space.

Riehle commented that it is a stunning project and asked if the photographic mural still existed. Bjornberg stated they will look to see if it has been covered or painted over.

Trimble asked if there would be photography or artwork other than interpretive. Bjornberg informed that the Lowry Hotel sign remains and they are working with art groups.

Staff and Bjornberg discussed the front plaza scoring patterns having subtle differences. Staff asked about the granite. Bjornberg stated something about difference sizes and sitting down over the plans.

Garbarini talked about the plaza and Sibley/Kellogg access along with the street level parking lot and proposed curb at Kellogg with two rows of trees and turf grass. She also discussed the plaza layout, the arbor and planters occupying a non-historic space as well as the trail, light fixtures and plantings (perennials and native grasses). The rows of plantings are a "nod" to the train tracks. The planters are custom and designed to relate to the platforms and columns under the waiting room. The arbor has canopy cover with a Sanborn Map design on it. Hill asked how the bike and pedestrian areas would be differentiated.

Garbarini showed a simplified plan for the plaza area at Sibley and Kellogg with some planters added.

Manning asked about consultation with SHPO on the plantings. Ferguson inquired about the double row of trees at the parking lot on Kellogg. Staff noted the plantings and other features will also be reviewed at a site plan review in DSI.

The second row of trees is proposed inside the boundaries of the parking lot. Manning stated it would be helpful to see a street level detail.

The shared concern about the amount of pigeon netting proposed was discussed as well as the concern about the netting proposed on the elevations of the historic buildings. Staff informed that DSI had discussed a pigeon birth-control program several years ago. Bjornberg stated that activity at the site will help disrupt the birds' pattern of use. Staff indicated that the netting may be appropriate under the waiting room, but not on elevations.

There was no one present to testify and staff did not receive any written testimony. Laffin motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations. Dana seconded the motion. Thomas asked about signage needs. The motion was approved10-0.

Riehle motioned to approve staff recommendations regarding the Section 106 review. Dana seconded the motion. Laffin asked for clarification about the two motions on the item. Staff explained the HPC role and the 106 role. This is a support statement. Trout-Oertel asked staff about streetscape elements and uniformity with Lowertown. Dana stated it will be reinforced as consultation continues. Laffin suggested utilizing permeable pavers like those on Fourth Street. The motion was approved10-0.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

VII. ADJOURN: 7:10

Submitted by: C. Boulware